



24.3.2023

## MISSION REPORT

following the fact-finding visit to Poland from 19 September 2022 to 21 September 2022 to follow up on petitions on access to education for the disabled pupils (0956/2018 and 1186/2018) and petitions on the situation in the primeval forest in Białowieża (0805/2017, 0812/2017 and 0623/2018)

Committee on Petitions

Members of the mission:

Dolors Montserrat (EPP) (Leader of the mission)  
Cristina Maestre Martín De Almagro (S&D)

Ex officio members:

Jarosław Duda (EPP)

## **Introduction**

The aims of the Committee on Petitions' fact-finding mission to Poland were to follow-up on petitions concerning breaches of EU environmental law, which put the primeval forest in Białowieża, protected under Natura 2000, at risk and to follow up on petitions concerning access to education for disabled pupils in Poland. The mission was authorised by the Bureau at its meeting on 16 December 2019. This mission, originally scheduled to take place from 18 to 20 May 2020, was postponed because of travel restrictions related to the COVID-19 pandemic and instead took place between 19 and 21 September 2022.

## **Petitions and petitioners**

### Petitions on access to education for disabled pupils (0956/2018 and 1186/2018)

*Petition 0956/2018: The petitioner raises the problem of children with disabilities in Poland who are following a specific individual course of study and who, owing to the new provisions of the Education Law introduced in September 2017, are having difficulties accessing education. According to the petitioner, the implementation of the new legislation deprives children with special educational needs of adequate support and the opportunity to access real education through integration. These children are segregated because of their health status and, in the petitioner's opinion, they have difficulties accessing further education in public schools, especially at secondary level. This situation deprives pupils of the opportunity to learn and interact with their peers and forces them to be individually tutored at home or brought to specialist, often remote, facilities at smaller centres, depriving them of the only free daily therapy and social interactions that they have. The options offered by the Polish Ministry of National Education to include these students in educational activities on school premises, either individually or in a group of up to five students, is not being implemented in practice. The lack of precise guidelines as to the number of hours that can be funded makes the situation of disabled pupils much worse and more uncertain.*

*Petition 1186/2018: The petitioner refers to the situation of Polish children who are not succeeding in the traditional educational system because of traumatic experiences, psychiatric treatment or various emotional disorders. According to the petitioner, in recent years, these children, who are temporarily handicapped, have not received adequate systemic aid. In the current system of special schools and reintegration facilities, there are no specific centres for younger children between the ages of 7 and 13 years old. The petitioner considers that children who are at a normal intellectual level, but who are not suited for traditional education owing to physical or posttraumatic reasons, should be placed in 24-hour open centres (residential schools) and provided with diagnostic, educational and therapeutic assistance. According to the petitioner, the legislation should be amended as soon as possible and a system of care should be organised in such a way as to not exclude this category of children and to promote their positive development.*

### Petitions on the situation in the primeval forest in Białowieża (0805/2017, 0812/2017 and 0623/2018)

*Petition 0805/2017: The petitioners, a group of seven Polish non-governmental organisations (NGOs), claim that the new legislation on forest management adopted by Poland in 2016*

*circumvents the environmental safeguards provided for in the EU birds and habitats directives and is having a massive, destructive effect on invaluable forest ecosystems. First, according to the petitioners, the new law establishes a blanket presumption that all forest management activities comply with the two EU directives, as long as they observe the ‘requirements of good forestry practice’, which have not yet been defined or regulated by any law. Consequently, forestry operations are now conducted in a legal vacuum, outside the scope of EU environmental legislation. Second, the petitioners argue that the law allows forest managers to disregard the safeguards laid out in the two directives for the of protected species protection of wild animals if their forest management activities are carried out based on forest management plans (an extension of a provision already found to be incompatible with EU law and which expired on 1 January 2017) or if they decide to use technologies that have been deemed to render the protection of wildlife impossible. The petitioners urge the European Parliament to ensure compliance with EU environmental legislation, given that intensive logging has already been carried out in recent months in three major Polish forests, threatening the existence of several species of endangered birds.*

*Petition 0812/2017: The petitioner condemns the deforestation of Białowieża Forest and the indiscriminate felling of trees, and requests that this forest area be placed under protection as soon as possible.*

*Petition 0623/2018: The petitioners are calling for a balanced approach between environmental standards in the Białowieża Forest region and the needs of the local residents. Environmental protection organisations have allegedly requested that the renovation of Narewowska Road, a key connection between two regional cities, be stopped, while residents claim the renovation works have been agreed upon and planned in compliance with all environmental standards, including those related to Natura 2000.*

### ***Summary account of meetings***

Monday, 19 September 2022

#### **11.00 -12.30 Meeting with Ms Daria Chmiel, Director of the ‘inclusive’ school in Warsaw and her team**

The delegation met with the director of the school, teachers, psychologists and pedagogues, as well as a graduate of the ‘inclusive’ school ‘Ką’’. This special-needs, integrational and inclusive high school also served as a secondary-level school between 2019 and 2022. From 1998 to 2019, the Polish education system was divided into six years of primary education, followed by three years of secondary education and three or four years of optional high-school education. In 2019, the three stages were merged into two.

The school representatives described the situation of the Polish inclusive education system. They highlighted the lack of psychologists and specialised pedagogues at all schooling levels (primary, secondary and high-school levels) and underlined that owing to remote or hybrid education in the 2020/2021 school year, the COVID-19 crisis had had a serious effect on the level of psychological disorders and distress among the youth population. They also pointed to the problem of inadequate systemic help for pupils who had abandoned standard educational paths because of different physical or mental disabilities.

**15.00-16.30 Meeting with Ms Marzena Machalek, Secretary of State, Government Plenipotentiary for the Promotion of the Educational Function of Schools and Educational Institutions, Inclusive Education and Vocational Training and representatives of the Ministry**

The delegation met with Ms Marzena Machałek, Polish Vice-Minister of Education. She insisted that the overall condition of inclusive education in Poland was good<sup>1</sup> and emphasised the situation of nearly 200 000 Ukrainian pupils – some of whom had special needs – who had been integrated into the Polish schooling system since the very beginning of the war in Ukraine (24 February 2022). She rejected petitioners' claims that Polish pupils with disabilities were discriminated against and required to stay at home. In her view, the Polish educational system was flexible, as there were specialised centres for children with disabilities, centres of social therapy and centres for youth placed there by the Polish justice system. Only in exceptional cases were children with a serious handicap sent to specialised schools or centres. The Ministry planned to spend large amounts of money in order to increase the number of specialised teachers at schools and to do specialised trainings for around 28 000 'standard teachers, according to an article entitled '*Czarnek o edukacji włączającej: prawie pół miliarda na psychologów*'<sup>2</sup> (Czarnek on Inclusive Education: half a billion for psychologists).

**16:30-17:45 Meeting with petitioners and experts from petition about education: Nos 0956/2018, 1186/2018**

The delegation met petitioners representing the petitions about education (petitions No 0956/2018 and No 1186/2018). The petitioners insisted on their claims. They said that discrimination against pupils with disabilities happened not only at the primary and secondary levels, but also at the university level. Petitioners stressed that there were an increasing number of pupils with disabilities who were unable to follow a traditional education path, and they complained about the lack of trained teachers. The petitioner from petition No 0956/2018 said that the education reforms had deprived disabled pupils of individual education at the school, forced their parents to stop working and had a negative psychological effect, including higher levels of suicide among young people.

The petitioner from petition No 1186/2018 insisted that there was a lack of proper legislation and delegated acts concerning pupils with difficulties (such as those taking psychotropic medicines). She also highlighted the absence of specialised teachers.

Ms Elżbieta Kucińska, an expert from the specialised social therapy centres who had worked with persons with special educational needs for 28 years, highlighted the importance of

---

<sup>1</sup> '*Students with special educational needs are already taught in public schools. Various forms of psychological and pedagogical assistance cover one third of pupils, and 64.6 % of pupils with disabilities are taught, according to their parents' choice, in public schools. Professional support — due to mental disorders — requires 9 % of students. The parents of a child holding a decision on the need for special education shall choose a school for their child: public, inclusive or special*' said Adrianna Całus, Polish Ministry of Education Spokesperson.

<sup>2</sup> '*In response to the presence of children with rulings on the need for special education in public schools, special support centres for inclusive education, where special school teachers transfer appropriate competences to teachers of open schools. He added [Minister Czarnek] that this year PLN 700 million was allocated for this purpose, including PLN 520 million for an additional 18 000 posts of specialists in public schools: psychologists, special educators, speech therapists and others. Next year it will be over PLN 1.5 billion*' (wpolityce.pl).

diagnosing pupils with ADHD and those with self-harming and suicidal behaviours early in order to avoid putting those pupils into ‘special’ schools. She explained the necessity of helping teachers and parents of pupils with all sorts of disabilities to better deal with their problems.

**18:00-19:30 Meeting with petitioners, experts and NGOs from petitions about the environment: petitions Nos 0805/2017, 0812/2017 and 0623/2018**

The petitioner from petition No 0805/2017 from the organisation Workshop for All Beings described the logging in the Białowieża Forest in 2016 and 2017, which had been later challenged by Polish NGOs and the Polish Ombudsman. The Polish authorities had never considered this contestation, holding that it was an administrative decision. The NGOs’ complaint to the Commission led to deliberations by the Court of Justice of the EU (CJEU) and its final ruling enforcing a halt to the logging (under a threat of a minimum penalty of EUR 4.3 million and possible daily penalties of up to EUR 300 000 for each day that the judgment was not heeded). In 2021, some logging in Białowieża Forest had resumed.

The petitioner from petition No 0805/2017 described further possible threats, such as the construction of a new road on the edge of Białowieża Park and the construction of a fence on the border with Belarus. He claimed that forest management plans published by the Polish State Forests could not be challenged in Polish courts. He added that some activities had been carried out by the Polish State Forests without forest management plans.

Representatives of other NGOs (Greenpeace Poland, ClientEarth) confirmed that logging in 2016 and 2017 had only been carried out outside of the protected area in Białowieża National Park (covering 17 % of Białowieża Forest) and that the logging had stopped after the CJEU ruling.

Professor Michał Żmihorski from the Polish Academy of Sciences gave a presentation about forestry (specifically silviculture, woodland-oriented forest management). In his opinion, silviculture was causing huge damage to the forest. Fenced parts where the trees were being re-cultivated were very problematic (fences were harmful for animals). In that kind of forest, the dominate species of trees were spruce and pine. Pesticides were being used and that kind of forestry caused the soil to dry out. In 2012, a bark beetle outbreak in the forest heavily influenced surrounding forests. After condemned trees were cut down, artificial replanting took place. Professor Żmihorski stated that if we wanted to safeguard biodiversity and stop climate change, we should stop this kind of forestry.

Tuesday, 20 September 2022

**12.30-14.30 Visit to Białowieża Forest**

- **Meeting with State Forests representatives**

The delegation went on a field visit to the local forest management unit ‘Nadleśnictwo Białowieża’ (Białowieża Forest District) near Podolany II. The Natura 2000 site covers the Białowieża, Browsk and Hajnówka districts and the Białowieża National Park (105.2 km<sup>2</sup>). Białowieża Forest covers an area of around 60 000 ha on the Polish side of the border (out of a total of 141 885 ha in Poland and in Belarus).

State Forests' acting Deputy Director, Jan Tabor, and the Deputy Head of Forests in Białowieża, Tomasz Ginszt, accompanied by colleagues from two other districts, showed the delegation examples of sanitation felling from 2016, 2017 and 2021. They gave a presentation on the bark beetle infestation of 2012. When the infestation started in 2012, it mostly affected spruce and pine trees. Around 60 % of old and tall spruce trees perished. Felling and sanitation treatment in 2016 and 2017 was approved under Polish law (around 250 000 m<sup>3</sup> of spruce trees were felled in 2016 and about 2 % of trees in the forest were felled in 2017 for safety reasons). Work was carried out only in essential areas outside the National Park (2 000 out of 12 600 ha). Felling was discontinued following the Court of Justice (CJEU) judgment in 2018<sup>3</sup>. Around 20 % of the forest was replanted with oak and hornbeam and the remaining area regenerated spontaneously.

Responding to questions put by Members of the delegation, they explained that the forest management plans for the 2012-2021 period were internal documents of the Polish State Forests. The Regional Directorate for Environmental Protection (RDOŚ) set up the 'Natura 2000' management plans after public consultations were announced in the forest, in the local press and on the internet. Annexes were added to the Białowieża Forest management plans twice in this period: in 2016 and 2021. One annex in 2017 concerning the Hajnówka district was rejected.

They confirmed that the forest management plans could not be challenged or modified by external parties. Formal errors in the plans could be challenged in administrative courts, but not their content. They maintained that sustainable forest management covering a mix of different types of forests – reservations, re-cultivated areas and open areas – could help to preserve biodiversity. For example, when spruce trees disappear, the populations of certain species such as pygmy owls or three-toed woodpeckers disappear too. Active preservation was therefore necessary.

After a short journey, the delegation visited Narewowska Road<sup>4</sup> (mentioned in petition 0623/2018), which was modernised in 2018 with a mineral surface. The speed limit on this road is 30 km per hour.

The delegation then visited part of the forest where dead spruce trees had been felled in 2017 (Tryba Wilcza)<sup>5</sup>. This part of the forest died around 10 years ago and it would take years for it to recover. The forest rangers explained that the trees had been felled for safety reasons, generally near roads and not inside the forest area. During the bark beetle breakout, old spruce trees died and then young trees (less than 50 years old) were also attacked by beetles. The tree species that are mostly used for re-cultivation are lime, oak and hornbeam.

- **Meeting with Białowieża National Park representatives**

The delegation visited the historical part of the reservation, which was created in 1921. The

---

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.lasy.gov.pl/en/poland-implements-cjeu-judgment>

<sup>4</sup> [https://bialowieza.bialystok.lasy.gov.pl/de/aktualnosci/-/asset\\_publisher/J2Fu9wuoZqJd/content/droga-narewowska-oddana-do-uzytkowania](https://bialowieza.bialystok.lasy.gov.pl/de/aktualnosci/-/asset_publisher/J2Fu9wuoZqJd/content/droga-narewowska-oddana-do-uzytkowania)

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VwsWSSl1OXM>



Białowieża National Park is the oldest of 23 national parks in Poland. This is the last natural primeval forest in the European lowland area. It is part of a biosphere reservation and it is a UNESCO World Heritage site<sup>6</sup>. The park has unique biological diversity – some flora and fauna species in the park are found only in a few other places worldwide. The natural environment is under strict protection. Białowieża Forest is the last mainstay of the lowland European bison (around 500 live in the Polish part of the forest).

**16.30-18.00 Meetings with petitioner (0623/2018), local authorities and local community, forest management authorities and the Białowieża National Park authorities**

- **Meeting with the petitioner from petition 0623/2018**

The petitioner claimed that Narewowska Road was important for families, other users (tourists) and especially commuters. Narewowska Road is a 20 km shortcut from Białowieża to Narewka (total distance of 40 km) that links the population of Narewka (around 3 000) and Białowieża (around 2 500 inhabitants). The petitioner highlighted positive aspects such as improved safety after modernisation, the establishment of a speed limit (30 km/hour) and a useful bicycle connection.

- **Meeting with the Mayor of the town of Hajnówka, Mr Jerzy Sirak**

Mayor Sirak spoke about the historical evolution of the town of Hajnówka. He explained that the increase in Białowieża Park's surface area in 1996 and the inclusion of Białowieża Forest in the Natura 2000 network had mostly had a negative impact on Hajnówka's inhabitants. The Polish authorities had never paid the promised compensation for the land which was no longer usable by local inhabitants for agriculture or logging in 1996. Moreover, around 1 000 jobs were lost and the town's population dropped. The local population had made several applications for using wood and branches from Białowieża Forest for heating their homes. Unemployment in the region was quite high (around 20 %). Industry in Hajnówka has since been diversified but tourism should be promoted.

- **Meeting with the Director of the Białowieża National Park, Mr Michał Krzysiak**

The Director of the Białowieża National Park, Mr Michał Krzysiak, described the park's statute: the natural processes of flora and fauna are under protection and there are separate legal regulations that provide for its legal status<sup>7</sup>. In 1996, after the enlargement of the northern part of the park where spruce is prevalent, the bark beetle infestation took hold. In his opinion, the forest will heal itself, but this of course is a lengthy process.

Wednesday, 21 September 2022

**09.00-10.30 Meeting with Deputy Minister Ms Małgorzata Golińska and representatives of the Ministry of Climate and Environment**

Minister Golińska welcomed the delegation and presented the activities and functioning of State Forests in Poland. She underlined the importance of the 10-year forest management

---

<sup>6</sup> <https://whc.unesco.org/en/soc/4150/>

<sup>7</sup> <https://crfop.gdos.gov.pl/CRFOP/widok/viewparknarodowy.jsf?fop=PL.ZIPOP.1393.PN.8>

plans. The last plan for Białowieża Forest ended on 31 December 2021. The Ministry is preparing a new plan for managing the forest. Deputy Minister Golińska explained the general structure of nature reserves, natural monuments, parks and economic areas in forests. She confirmed that the 2018 CJEU ruling would be fully implemented and that felling would be discontinued. The minister further added that the preparation of forest management plans generally took 2 to 3 years and was done in cooperation with RDOŚ in accordance with draft plans of protective tasks for the areas covered by Natura 2000. There is an opportunity for the public and the fire and rescue services to participate and for NGOs to submit remarks in writing. The final decision to approve the forest management plans lies with the Ministry of Climate and Environment.

Ms Montserrat inquired about potential consultations with the European Commission on the forest management plans.

The Ministry of Climate and Environment has held discussions concerning management plans and projects in view of the CJEU ruling. State Forests were ready to respond to any further detailed requests. The projects had been sent to the Commission for information purposes.

Ms Maestre asked about the legal and administrative framework of forest management in Poland, inquiring whether the Polish rules were in compliance with the EU directives on the protection of flora and fauna (birds and habitats directives). Concerning the current period of forest management plans (2022-2031), Ms Maestre asked if intensive logging would be limited and local interests protected.

Minister Golińska explained there was a difference between the State Forest management plans and the statute of the Białowieża National Park. Polish State Forests supervise commercial forests (around 80 % of all forests in Poland). State Forests are divided into 17 regional directorates and 429 districts (three in Białowieża Forest). The minister confirmed that the forest management plans were designed taking into consideration all of the conditions: UNESCO protection zones with varying rules in place, protected areas, Polish and EU law.

In the next round of questions and answers, the discussion centred on the problems of sustainable forest management, Polish examples of habitat restoration and possible future threats to the forest (such as bark beetle).

To a question on ways of challenging forest management plans, the minister alleged that several complaints had been made.

The minister also replied that the last infestation had mainly affected spruce. Now, since spruce is not dominant anymore, another bark beetle infestation was less probable. There were other pathogens, however, and a high risk of forest fires. The solution to these threats was to enhance biodiversity through the active protection of the forest (such as by eliminating dominant species through the conversion of forest stands<sup>8</sup> and adaptation to the habitat). Passive protection would lead to the destruction of forests. It had been suggested to protect

---

<sup>8</sup> Conversion of forest stands means a shift in the composition of tree species in order to adjust it to the composition characteristic of a natural habitat by means of pruning, regenerative cutting or thinning (turning a forest into a multi-layered formation).



the core of the forest, adapt the area surrounding the core and leave an external layer of timberland.

The State Forests representatives insisted that support for local communities was needed for them to coexist with the forest. State Forests supports the tourism industry (investing in roads, hiking trails, parking areas and view towers). The national government has provided subsidies (amounting to around EUR 10 billion) for renovations, new infrastructure and promotion ('green municipalities'). The National Fund for Environmental Protection and Water Management plans to support projects related to the protection of the environment.

Forest management plans are prepared either by a public institution called Biuro Urządzania Lasu i Geodezji Leśnej (Forest Management and Forest Geodesy Office) subordinated to the Ministry of Environment or by smaller private companies selected in tender procedures.

### **11.00-12.30 Press conference held by the Chair of the delegation**

During the press conference, media representatives asked the delegation questions about the correct implementation of legal requirements concerning pupils with disabilities in the Polish educational system. The Q&A also focused on the correct implementation of the birds and habitats directives and Natura 2000 regulations in the areas covered by the network.

### ***Conclusions***

The Members of the delegation shared the opinion that schools in Poland at all levels should be inclusive to allow pupils with all kinds of disabilities – mental, physical or problems of adaptation – to fully participate in the educational system. Education should be inclusive and young people should not be left at home, on the margins of society.

Problems with the mental health of pupils should be taken into consideration through the provision of appropriate help: psychological and teaching support, as well as support for parents and families.

The Members of the delegation concluded that environmental conditions in Białoweża Forest should be established according to European standards in order to comply with the EU birds and habitats directives and to ensure the implementation of the protection task plan for the Natura 2000 area. The management process should be transparent. A balance should be maintained between the protection goals and local communities' interest.

## ***Recommendations***

On the basis of this fact-finding visit, the Committee on Petitions makes the following recommendations to the competent regional and national Polish authorities:

### The petitions on access to education for disabled pupils (0956/2018 and 1186/2018):

1. Provide educational and psychological support at schools and specialised early detection centres for children and young people with disabilities.
2. Provide specialised training for teachers in all schools to help them work with children with difficulties and disabilities.
3. Involve families and specialised NGOs in creating more inclusive schools and take inspiration from best practices in other countries.
4. Ensure that pupils with special educational needs are socialised by providing them either with inclusive education or individual teaching in schools.
5. Keep petitions 0956/2018 and 1186/2018 open; pending developments, a decision will be made at a later stage about how to proceed with the petitions.

### The petitions on the situation in the Białowieża primeval forest (0805/2017, 0812/2017 and 0623/2018):

6. All logging activity must be suspended until a strict level of protection is guaranteed within the Białowieża Natura 2000 site in order to prevent illegal logging activities in the Białowieża Forest in line with the CJEU ruling.
7. The management of the primeval forest in Białowieża should be based on scientific knowledge and nature protection requirements to comply with the EU Birds Directive<sup>9</sup> and Habitats Directive<sup>10</sup> and to ensure compliance with the plan on how to protect the Białowieża Natura 2000 site. Therefore, any interference with the habitats (e.g. forest stands over 100 years old) and species protected by this plan that occurs when implementing the forest management plans for 2021-2032 and other plans concerning the management of the forest, is in contravention of EU law.
8. In the interests of local communities, sustainable development must be guaranteed and must take into account the region's protected status and the legal requirements of nature conservation. The planning and implementation of projects that may have a negative impact on nature in the Białowieża Forest require proper environmental impact assessment and, in the case of issuing a permit, effective minimisation and compensation measures. Projects that significantly threaten the nature conservation status of the Białowieża Forest should not be allowed.
9. No activities should be carried out without valid forest management plans. Internal administrative documents, such as forest business plans, should be publically available

---

<sup>9</sup> OJ L 20, 26.1.2010, p. 7.

<sup>10</sup> OJ L 206, 22.7.1992, p. 7.

and subject to scrutiny.

10. There are a number of nature protection measures in the Białowieża Forest, including nature reserves and protection zones. It is also a national park, UNESCO World Heritage Site and Natura 2000 site and activities undertaken in the forest have to comply with different legal and protection systems. These measures must continue in the future.
11. The voice of the local community, local government and services such as firefighters must continue to be taken into account in forest management and other plans.
12. Any human intervention that aims to maintain the treasured and precious, but vulnerable, Białowieża Forest may be possible in certain areas. Such interventions must be justified by concern for the ecosystem (including the fight against invasive species) and the safety of people, and supported by scientific evidence.
13. It should be possible to challenge forest management plans in court, not only on their formal aspects but also on their content.
14. The management of public forests in Poland requires the national law to be adapted to comply with European directives to ensure that plant, animal and fungi species as well as habitats are protected. Public access to justice when challenging decisions that approve forest management plans in national courts must be guaranteed. Access to information, public participation in decision-making and access to justice in environmental matters must be granted.
15. A new 10-year (2022-2031) forest management plan for the Białowieża Forest should be widely publicised and stakeholders should be consulted. The plans should comply with the CJEU ruling on the Białowieża Forest and should not allow activities in breach of the Białowieża Forest Natura 2000 site management plan.
16. The interests of the local residents and the maintenance of the precious and pristine Białowieża Forest should be reconciled so as not to neglect the rights and needs of the people living in this area.
17. The impacts of the construction of the Polish-Belarusian border wall on the integrity of the Natura 2000 site and on the migration and conservation of species must be properly assessed in order to comply with the provisions of the Habitats Directive. Adequate measures should also be adopted to support the migration of all species, including large animals.
18. Petitions 0805/2017, 0812/2017 should remain open; pending developments, a decision will be made at a later stage about how to proceed with petitions.
19. Close petition 0623/2018.

## INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

<b>Date adopted</b>	22.03.2023
<b>Result of final vote</b>	+: 21 -: 3 0: 3
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Andris Ameriks, Margrete Auken, Alexander Bernhuber, Francesca Donato, Agnès Evren, Gheorghe Falcă, Alexis Georgoulis, Vlad Gheorghe, Peter Jahr, Radan Kanev, Stelios Kypourouopoulos, Cristina Maestre Martín De Almagro, Ana Miranda, Dolors Montserrat, Emil Radev, Sira Rego, Frédérique Ries, Massimiliano Smeriglio, Michal Wiezik, Tatjana Ždanoka, Kosma Złotowski
<b>Substitutes present for the final vote</b>	Mario Furore, Sylvie Guillaume, Maite Pagazaurtundúa, Cristian Terheş
<b>Substitutes under Rule 200(2) present for the final vote</b>	Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Bogdan Rzońca

## FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

21	+
NI	Mario Furore, Tatjana Ždanoka
PPE	Alexander Bernhuber, Agnès Evren, Gheorghe Falcă, Peter Jahr, Radan Kanev, Stelios Kypourouopoulos, Dolors Montserrat, Emil Radev
Renew	Vlad Gheorghe, Maite Pagazaurtundúa, Frédérique Ries, Michal Wiezik
S&D	Andris Ameriks, Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Sylvie Guillaume, Cristina Maestre Martín De Almagro, Massimiliano Smeriglio
The Left	Alexis Georgoulis, Sira Rego

3	-
ECR	Bogdan Rzońca, Cristian Terheş, Kosma Złotowski

3	0
NI	Francesca Donato
Vers/ALE	Margrete Auken, Ana Miranda

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention